

City of Dublin Architectural Review Board

Planning Report

Wednesday, April 24, 2013

6135 Rings Road – Site and Architectural Modifications

Case Summary

Agenda Item	3
Case Number	13-025ARB
Proposal	Modifications to the existing site and building, including the creation of a new entrance vestibule and covered vehicular drop-off area located to the rear of the building, and associated site improvements.
Request	Review and approval of architectural and site modifications for a historic property located outside of the Historic District under the provisions of Code Section 153.070 and the <i>Historic Dublin Design Guidelines</i> .
Site Location	6135 Rings Road, located on the south side of Rings Road, west of Avery Road.
Applicant	James Kuhn, Berardi and Partners, Inc.
Case Managers	Jennifer M. Rauch, AICP, Planner II. (614) 410-4690 or jrauch@dublin.oh.us
Planning Recommendation	Approval with conditions. Based on Planning's analysis the proposed architectural and site modifications meet the criteria of the <i>Historic Dublin Design Guidelines</i> and Zoning Code and approval with two conditions is recommended.
Conditions	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1) An alternative cladding material that complements the existing materials, such as cast stone be used in the areas located below the windows and doors in order to meet the Building Code.2) A detailed landscape plan be provided as part of the building permit review to ensure the interior landscaping and vehicular use area screening requirements are met.



Facts	
Site Description	13.749 acres
Zoning	R2, Limited Suburban Residential District
Surrounding Zoning and Uses	North: PCD, Planned Commerce District (Balgriffin Plan) East, South, West: R2, Limited Suburban Residential District
Site Features	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Historic portion of the church is located in northwest corner of the structure. • Expanded sanctuary the east and south of the historic portion. • Two access points located along Rings Road. • Parking in western and southern portion.
Case Background	<p><i>Architectural Review Board</i> May 27, 1998 and April 23, 1997: Approval of an expansion to the existing church.</p> <p><i>Board of Zoning Appeals</i> June 19, 1997: Approval of a parking variance.</p>

Details	Architectural and Site Modifications
Historical Background	The original portion of the church which is on the National Register of Historic Places was built in the late 1800s and early 1900s at the northwest corner of the site. Several large additions have since been constructed at the rear and east side of the building. The current request is regarding modifications to the expanded, non-historic portion of the church. The site is located outside of the Historic District, but modifications to the site require review and approval by the Architectural Review Board.
Proposal	The modifications are proposed to the rear of the existing building and include the enclosure of an existing covered entrance and the construction of a new covered walkway and vehicular drop-off area. The new drop-off area requires modifications to the existing parking lot. The proposal includes the construction of a new 26-space parking area east of the existing building.
Architectural Modifications and Materials	<p>The rear of the building contains an existing covered area, which the applicant is proposing to enclose to create a new vestibule and receiving area. The proposed enclosure will connect to a new covered walkway and drop-off area. The vestibule and covered drop-off will incorporate design features and materials matching the existing building. The vestibule will be constructed of an arch top, aluminum storefront window system located between the existing brick columns and a new entry door system.</p> <p>The area located below the windows and doors to grade is proposed as stucco, which is not permitted per the Building Code. Planning and Building Standards recommend the use of an alternative cladding material that complements the existing materials, such as cast stone.</p> <p>The proposed covered walkway and drop-off area is steel frame construction painted to match the proposed brick. The proposed columns will match the building using brick with a cast stone base, and the gabled roof is proposed with asphalt shingles to match the remainder of the existing building.</p>

Details Architectural and Site Modifications	
	A new steel canopy is proposed west of the new enclosed vestibule area and is intended to screen mechanical units. Screening will be required to the top of the units.
Parking Lot Modifications	<p>The proposal includes the reconfiguration of the parking area at the rear of building. A new 24-foot wide drive aisle will be moved closer to the existing building and remove a portion of the existing lawn next to the building. The new drive aisle will provide access to the proposed covered drop-off area. A new, large landscape island will be created to separate the drop-off area from the parking lot and will provide a new staircase to provide pedestrian access to the main parking lot. The existing drive aisle along the northern portion of the parking lot will be altered slightly to accommodate the reconfiguration. Two of the smaller, existing landscape islands will be modified to accommodate the drive aisle and three parking spaces will be removed.</p> <p>The proposal includes the construction of a 26-space parking area to the east of the existing building. The proposed area will be accessed from the eastern driveway on Rings Road.</p>
Landscaping	The proposal modifies two of the landscape islands in the northern portion of the existing parking area, and four new landscape islands within the newly proposed parking area. A detailed landscape plan will need to be provided with the building permit to ensure the interior landscaping and vehicular use area screening requirements are met for the parking areas. The proposed modifications indicate the removal of 18 inches of protected trees, which are shown as replaced on site per Code.

Analysis Architectural and Site Modifications	
Process	Section 153.070 of the Zoning Code identifies criteria for the review and approval of a Board Order for proposals within the Architectural Review District Boundaries (full text of criteria attached). Following is an analysis by Planning based on those criteria.
General Review Standards	
1) <i>Character and Materials Compatible with Context.</i>	Criterion met with condition: The proposed modifications complement the existing building design and use of building materials, color and detail. Planning and Building Standards recommend the use of an alternative cladding material that complements the existing materials, such as cast stone in the areas located below the windows and doors in order to meet the Building Code.
2) <i>Recognition and Respect of Historical or Acquired Significance.</i>	Criterion met: The proposed improvements are located to the rear of the building and do not alter the existing historic portion of the church.

Analysis		Architectural and Site Modifications
3) <i>Compatible with Relevant Design Characteristics.</i>		Criterion met: The proposed improvements fit with the architectural details and materials of the existing building.
4) <i>Appropriate Massing and Building Form.</i>		Criterion met: The proposed improvements are small in scale and are located to the rear of the building.
5) <i>Appropriate Color Scheme</i>		Criterion met: The proposed building materials are appropriate and match the existing building.
6) <i>Complementary Sign Design</i>		Not Applicable
7) <i>Appropriate Landscape Design</i>		Criterion met with condition: A detailed landscape plan will need to be provided with the building permit to ensure the interior landscaping and vehicular use area screening requirements are met for the parking areas.
8) <i>Preservation of archaeological resources</i>		Not Applicable
Alteration to Buildings, Structure, and Site		
1) <i>Reasonable Effort to Minimize Alteration of Buildings and Site.</i> 2) <i>Conformance to Original Distinguishing Character.</i> 3) <i>Retention of Historic Building Features and Materials.</i> 4) <i>Alteration Recognizes Historic Integrity and Appropriateness.</i> 5) <i>Recognition and Respect of Historical or Acquired Significance.</i> 6) <i>Sensitive Treatment of Distinctive Features.</i> 7) <i>Appropriate Repair or Replacement of Significant Architectural Features.</i> 8) <i>Sensitively Maintained Historic Building Materials.</i>		Criteria met: The proposed improvements are at the rear of the building and do not alter the existing historic portion of the church. The proposed improvements provide an amenity for users and while maintaining the historic significance of the existing church. Architectural and site modifications are appropriate and fit well with the existing expanded portion of the church.

Analysis Architectural and Site Modifications	
Additions to Building, Structure, Site	
1) <i>Use of Traditional Materials</i>	Criterion met: The proposed modifications complement the existing building design and use of building materials, color and detail.
2) <i>Compatible Design</i>	Criterion met: The proposed improvements complement the existing church.
3) <i>Additions Clearly Distinguished</i>	Criterion met: The proposed improvements are located to the rear of the building and do not alter the existing historic portion of the church.
4) <i>Additions Recognized as Products of Own Time</i>	Not Applicable

Recommendation Approval With Conditions	
Summary	Planning has reviewed the proposed architectural and site modifications with respect to the Zoning Code as well as the <i>Historic Dublin Design Guidelines</i> and recommends approval with two conditions.
Conditions	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) An alternative cladding material that complements the existing materials, such as cast stone be used in the areas located below the windows and doors in order to meet the Building Code. 2) A detailed landscape plan be provided as part of the building permit review to ensure the interior landscaping and vehicular use area screening requirements are met.

Architectural Review Board – Standards of Review

The following outlines the full text of the review criteria (summarized above) for all Architectural Review Board applications as outlined in Section 153.174(B) of the Dublin Zoning Code.

(3) *General Character*

- (a) The design of new structures and of additions to existing structures, including new site improvements, shall take into account the architectural style, general design, arrangement, texture, materials and color of other structures and site within the District and immediate vicinity.
- (b) Where changes have taken place in the course of time as evidence of the history and development of adjacent or nearby buildings, structures or sites, if these changes are deemed to have acquired significance and would be compromised by the proposed new development, then this significance shall be recognized and respected in the design of the new development.

(4) *Architectural Style.* There are a number of intermixes of architectural styles, as well as a larger number of buildings of such modest nature or so extensively remodeled to effectively lose all architectural importance. It is with reference to the basic architectural character of the key buildings noted above that the need for compatibility in the future construction in the District should be made. Compatibility does not infer imitation, but rather an appropriate design in terms of scale, building materials and detail. The architectural character of the various areas of the District consists mainly of four themes:

- (a) Simple rectangular commercial buildings with exterior construction of rubble or random Ashlar limestone, one, one and one-half, or two stories high with gable roof and ridgeline parallel to the street, mainly of the era of 1820 to 1890.
- (b) Simple rectangular commercial buildings and outbuildings with exterior construction of frame with horizontal siding and corner trim, one, one and one-half, or two stories high with gable roof and ridgeline parallel to the street, mainly of the era of 1820 to 1890.
- (c) Residential buildings with exterior construction of rubble or random Ashlar limestone, or red brick laid up in common bond, or frame with horizontal siding and corner trim, mainly of the era of 1820 to 1890.
- (d) Residential buildings with stone on facades, one to one-half stories, mainly of the era 1950-1970.

(5) *Massing and Building Form.* Massing of new buildings shall be generally similar to those in adjacent and nearby buildings. Building forms should generally reflect those of the architectural style of the building and the Historic District. Variations of gabled roof forms are preferred. Window to wall ratios should be appropriate to the type and use of building constructed.

(6) *Color.* Traditional colors and combinations of those colors that are both identified with the origin or the era in which the structure or property was originally built and approved by the Architectural Review Board shall be used for exteriors for all new structures to be built, and reconstruction, remodeling and exterior maintenance of existing structures within the Architectural Review District. Fluorescent or luminescent colors are prohibited.

- (7) *Signs.* Signs should be designed to complement the nineteenth century Early American character of the district by incorporating design features common to signs from the 1800s. Materials should complement the architectural character of the District and colors should consistent with the era of the building. Sign types consistent with the character of the Historic District include wall, projecting, window, awning, and sandwich boards.
 - (8) *Landscaping.* The landscape design of the site should be consistent with the overall architectural and historic character of the structures on the site. Plant material and methods for installation shall be selected respecting the nature of the urban environment and the survivability and diversity of the plan species. Non-plant material shall be of a type associated with the origin or era in which the structure was originally built. Significant features of the original landscape, e.g., stone walls, shall be preserved.
 - (9) *Archaeological.* Every reasonable effort shall be made to record, protect and preserve archaeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.
- (C) *Alterations to Buildings, Structure and Site.* In addition to the General Review Standards, the following shall be met by applications for alterations to existing buildings, outbuildings, structures, and sites prior to approval of a Board Order.
- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to ensure that the use of the property will involve minimal alteration of an existing building, structure or site and its environment.
 - (2) The alteration shall conform to the distinguishing, original exterior qualities or character of the structure, its site, and its environment.
 - (3) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a period building, structure, site and/or its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural or environmental features should be avoided when possible.
 - (4) All buildings, structures and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance inconsistent or inappropriate to the original integrity of the building shall be discouraged.
 - (5) Whereas changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure or site and its environment, if these changes are deemed to have acquired significance, then this significance shall be recognized and respected.
 - (6) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure or site shall be treated with sensitivity.
 - (7) Significant architectural features which have deteriorated should be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities whenever possible. Repair or replacement of architectural features should be based on accurate duplication of the feature, and if possible, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
 - (8) The surface cleaning of structures, if provided as part of the application, shall be undertaken with methods designed to minimize damage to historic building materials.

Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials should be avoided.

- (D) *Additions to Existing Buildings, Structures, and Site.* In addition to the General Review Standards, the following shall be met by applications for additions to existing buildings, outbuildings, structures, and site prior to approval of a Board Order.
- (1) Materials for additions should be traditional to the District, but need not match those of the original structure to which the addition is attached.
 - (2) Contemporary design for additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when they do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural materials, and the design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment. Roofline additions are discouraged or should be placed and designed to have the least amount of visual impact.
 - (2) Additions should be clearly distinguishable from the original structure by keeping additions at a smaller scale where appropriate or other similar measures. The intent of an addition should be that if the additions or alterations were removed the essential form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired. Additions should generally be located to the rear of the original building so that the most significant and visible faces of historic properties are given priority. Additions to the front should be clearly separated from the original building and simplified in design to not detract from the historic aspects of the structure.
 - (3) All buildings, structures and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Additions with no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance inconsistent or inappropriate to the original integrity of the building shall be discouraged.